

# **STATE OF MAINE/STATE PLANNING OFFICE**

## **Determination of Public Benefit for Juniper Ridge Landfill Expansion**

**Department Order #S-020700-W5-AU-N**

**APPEAL – Edward S. Spencer**

- **Statutory and Regulatory References**



G. The project will not unreasonably cause or increase the flooding of the alteration area or adjacent properties nor create an unreasonable flood hazard to a structure. [1993, c. 680, Pt. A, §37 (RPR) .]

[ 1993, c. 680, Pt. A, §37 (RPR) .]

**2-G. Setback requirement for land application and off-site storage of sludge.** The department may not issue a license for a sludge land application site that is within 75 feet of a river, perennial stream or great pond. The department may not issue a license for a sludge storage site or storage facility off the site of generation that is within 250 feet of a river, perennial stream or great pond. Upon the written request to the department of a person who owns property that abuts a sludge land application site or storage facility, the department shall restrict the sludge application or sludge storage site to no less than 50 feet from that abutting property boundary. The board may establish other setbacks by rule.

[ 1999, c. 393, §5 (NEW) .]

### 3. Public benefit determination.

[ 1995, c. 465, Pt. A, §14 (RP); 1995, c. 465, Pt. C, §2 (AFF) .]

**3-A. Public benefit determination.** Public benefit determination is made in the following manner.

A. For the following facilities, the department determines public benefit and shall employ a rebuttable presumption of public benefit:

(1) Solid waste disposal facilities less than 6 acres in size that accept only inert fill, construction and demolition debris, debris from land clearing and wood wastes; and

(2) Solid waste disposal facilities used exclusively for the disposal of waste generated by the owner of the facility except that the facility may accept, on a nonprofit basis, waste not generated by the owner provided that the amount so accepted does not exceed 15% of all solid waste accepted on an annual average. [1995, c. 465, Pt. A, §15 (NEW); 1995, c. 465, Pt. C, §2 (AFF) .]

B. For all other facilities, the commissioner shall make the determination of public benefit in accordance with section 1310-AA, and the commissioner's determination under that section is not subject to review by the department or the board as part of the licensing process under this section. [1995, c. 465, Pt. A, §15 (NEW); 1995, c. 465, Pt. C, §2 (AFF) .]

[ 1995, c. 465, Pt. A, §15 (NEW); 1995, c. 465, Pt. C, §2 (AFF) .]

### 4. Presumption of public benefit.

[ 1989, c. 585, Pt. E, §27 (RP) .]

### 5. Recycling and source reduction determination.

[ 2007, c. 583, §3 (RP) .]

**5-A. Recycling and source reduction determination.** The requirements of this subsection apply to solid waste disposal facilities and to solid waste processing facilities that generate residue requiring disposal.

A. An applicant for a new or expanded solid waste disposal facility shall demonstrate that:



## 38 §1310-AA. PUBLIC BENEFIT DETERMINATION

### 38 §1310-AA. PUBLIC BENEFIT DETERMINATION

**1. Application for public benefit determination.** Prior to submitting an application under section 1310-N for a license for a new or expanded solid waste disposal facility, a person must apply to the commissioner for a determination of whether the proposed facility provides a substantial public benefit.

[ 1995, c. 465, Pt. A, §22 (NEW); 1995, c. 465, Pt. C, §2 (AFF) .]

**1-A. Public benefit determination for acceptance by publicly owned solid waste landfills of waste generated out of state.** Prior to accepting waste that is not generated within the State, a solid waste facility that is subject to this subsection shall apply to the commissioner for a determination of whether the acceptance of the waste provides a substantial public benefit.

A. A facility is subject to this subsection if the facility is a solid waste landfill that is not a commercial solid waste disposal facility pursuant to:

- (1) Section 1303-C, subsection 6, paragraph A-2; ..
- (2) Section 1303-C, subsection 6, paragraph B-2; or
- (3) Section 1303-C, subsection 6, paragraph C-2. [2007, c. 338, §3 (NEW); 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF) .]

B. A facility that is subject to this subsection may not accept waste that is not generated within the State unless the commissioner determines that the acceptance of the waste provides a substantial public benefit. [2007, c. 338, §3 (NEW); 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF) .]

C. The commissioner shall make the determination of public benefit in accordance with subsections 2 and 3. [2007, c. 338, §3 (NEW); 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF) .]

D. For purposes of this subsection, "waste that is generated within the State" includes residue and bypass generated by incineration, processing and recycling facilities within the State; waste whether generated within the State or outside of the State used for daily cover, frost protection or stability; and waste generated within 30 miles of the solid waste disposal facility. [2007, c. 338, §3 (NEW); 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF) .]

[ 2007, c. 338, §3 (NEW); 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF) .]

**2. Process.** Determinations by the commissioner under this section are not subject to Title 5, chapter 375, subchapter 4. The commissioner shall provide public notice of the filing of an application under this section and shall accept written public comment on the application for 20 days after the date of the notice. In making the determination of whether the facility under subsection 1 or the acceptance of waste that is not generated within the State under subsection 1-A provides a substantial public benefit, the commissioner shall consider the state plan, written information submitted in support of the application and any other written information the commissioner considers relevant. The commissioner may hold a public meeting in the vicinity of the proposed facility under subsection 1 or the solid waste landfill under subsection 1-A to take public comments and shall consider those comments in making the determination. The commissioner shall issue a decision on the matter within 60 days of receipt of the application. The commissioner's decisions under this section may be appealed to the board, but the board is not authorized to assume jurisdiction of a decision under this section.

[ 2007, c. 338, §3 (AMD); 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF) ..]

**3. Standards for determination.** The commissioner shall find that the proposed facility under subsection 1 or the acceptance of waste that is not generated within the State under subsection 1-A provides a substantial public benefit if the applicant demonstrates to the commissioner that the proposed facility or the acceptance of waste that is not generated within the State:

A. Meets immediate, short-term or long-term capacity needs of the State; [1995, c. 465, Pt. A, §22 (NEW); 1995, c. 465, Pt. C, §2 (AFF).]

B. Except for expansion of a commercial solid waste disposal facility that accepts only special waste for landfilling, is consistent with the state waste management and recycling plan; [2007, c. 338, §3 (AMD); 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF).]

C. Is not inconsistent with local, regional or state waste collection, storage, transportation, processing or disposal; and [2007, c. 338, §3 (AMD); 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF).]

D. For a determination of public benefit under subsection 1-A only, facilitates the operation of a solid waste disposal facility and the operation of that solid waste disposal facility would be precluded or significantly impaired if the waste is not accepted. [2007, c. 655, §10 (AMD).]

[ 2007, c. 655, §10 (AMD) .]

**4. Application.** This section does not apply to facilities described in section 1310-N, subsection 3-A, paragraph A.

[ 2009, c. 348, §1 (AMD); 2009, c. 348, §3 (AFF) .]

**5. Modifications.** Public benefit determinations may be revised by the department if the department finds that a material change in the underlying facts or circumstances upon which a public benefit determination was based has occurred or is proposed, including, but not limited to, a change related to disposal capacity. The department may require the holder of a public benefit determination to submit an application for modification of that determination if the department finds that a change in the underlying facts or circumstances has occurred or is proposed.

[ 2007, c. 414, §5 (NEW) .]

**6. Substantial public benefit.** The department may not process or act upon any application for a new or expanded solid waste disposal facility owned by the State pending before the department on or after January 15, 2009 unless the commissioner determines, in accordance with this section, that the proposed facility provides a substantial public benefit.

[ 2009, c. 348, §2 (NEW); 2009, c. 348, §3 (AFF) .]

#### SECTION HISTORY

RR 1995, c. 1, §33 (COR). 1995, c. 314, §1 (NEW). 1995, c. 465, §A22 (NEW). 1995, c. 465, §C2 (AFF). 2007, c. 338, §3 (AMD). 2007, c. 338, §5 (AFF). 2007, c. 414, §§4, 5 (AMD). 2007, c. 655, §10 (AMD). 2009, c. 348, §§1, 2 (AMD). 2009, c. 348, §3 (AFF).

The State of Maine claims a copyright in its codified statutes. If you intend to republish this material, we require that you include the following disclaimer in your publication:

*All copyrights and other rights to statutory text are reserved by the State of Maine. The text included in this publication reflects changes made through the First Special Session of the 125th Maine Legislature, is current through December 31, 2011, and is subject to change without notice. It is a version that has not been officially certified by the Secretary of State. Refer to the Maine Revised Statutes Annotated and supplements for certified text.*

The Office of the Revisor of Statutes also requests that you send us one copy of any statutory publication you may produce. Our goal is not to restrict publishing activity, but to keep track of who is publishing what, to identify any needless duplication and to preserve the State's copyright rights.

PLEASE NOTE: The Revisor's Office cannot perform research for or provide legal advice or interpretation of Maine law to the public. If you need legal assistance, please contact a qualified attorney.

**Chapter 2: RULES CONCERNING THE PROCESSING OF APPLICATIONS AND OTHER ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS**

---

**SUMMARY:** These rules govern various administrative activities of the Department of Environmental Protection. Included within these rules are sections which apply to advisory opinions, license application requirements, application fees, public notice, public access to information, processing times, license transfers, and appeals to the Board of Environmental Protection.

---

1. **Definitions.** The following terms, as used in this Chapter, have the following meanings unless the context indicates otherwise:
  - A. **Abutter.** "Abutter" for the purposes of the notice provisions of this rule, means any person who owns property that is both (1) adjoining and (2) within 1 mile of the delineated project boundary, including owners of property directly across a public or private right of way.
  - B. **Aggrieved person.** "Aggrieved person" means any person whom the Board determines may suffer particularized injury as a result of a licensing or other decision.
  - C. **Amendment application.** "Amendment application" means any application to modify a license previously granted by the Department, except for minor revisions.
  - D. **Board.** "Board" means the Board of Environmental Protection.
  - E. **Chair.** "Chair" means the Chair of the Board of Environmental Protection, or his or her designee.
  - F. **Commissioner.** "Commissioner" means Commissioner of the Department of Environmental Protection, or his or her designee.
  - G. **Department.** "Department" means the Department of Environmental Protection, including the Board and the Commissioner.
  - H. **Department staff.** "Department staff" means all staff, except staff to the Board.
  - I. **Interested person.** "Interested Person" means any person who submits written comments on an application or who requests, in writing, receipt of materials related to a particular application.
  - J. **License.** "License" means any license, license amendment, license renewal, transfer, permit, variance, approval or certification issued by the Department.
  - K. **Licensee.** "Licensee" means the person named on the license.

- L. Minor revision.** "Minor Revision" means any proposal to modify a license previously granted by the Department, where the modification significantly decreases or eliminates an environmental impact, does not significantly expand the project, does not change the nature of the project or does not modify any Department findings with respect to any licensing criteria. This term may be further defined by the Board through bureau specific rules.
- M. Party.** "Party" means:
- (1) The specific person whose legal rights, duties or privileges are being determined in the proceeding; and
  - (2) Any person participating in an adjudicatory proceeding pursuant to 5 M.R.S.A. section 9054(1) or (2).
- N. Permit by rule.** "Permit by Rule" means any license or notification that is designated by the Board through rule under the authority of 38 M.R.S.A. section 344(7).
- O. Person.** "Person" means any individual; partnership; corporation; Federal, state or local government entity; association; or public or private organization of any character, except the agency conducting the proceeding.
- P. Processing time.** "Processing Time" means the time established by the Department to process an application, as published pursuant to 38 M.R.S.A. section 344-B(1) or otherwise provided by law.
- Q. Transfer of ownership.** "Transfer of Ownership" means a change in the legal entity that owns a property, facility or structure that is the subject of a license issued by the Department. A sale or exchange of stock, or a merger, is not a transfer of ownership for the purposes of this rule provided the legal entity that owns the property, facility or structure remains the same.

**2. Scope of rules.**

- A. General scope.** These rules apply to processing of applications made to the Department for new, renewed, amended or transferred licenses, and other determinations on specific matters made by the Department, except as noted in section 2(B) of this rule. These rules apply in the absence of procedural requirements imposed by statute or rule. Where other specific procedural requirements apply, those requirements control.
- B. Exceptions.** Groundwater oil clean up fund claims, applications for one-time disposal of special waste; asbestos or lead abatement licenses and certifications; third party damage claims; license or permit by rule; registrations or notifications; waste transporter licenses; reimbursement claims; closure plans; public benefit determinations; occupational licenses and minor revisions are not subject to this chapter, unless specifically included.

The procedure for review is the same as for an appeal of a Commissioner's final license decision as described in section 24(B) of this rule.

**B. Appeal to the Board of a Commissioner's decision.**

- (1) **Appeal period.** Within 30 days of the filing of a license decision by the Commissioner with the Board, an aggrieved person may appeal to the Board for review of the Commissioner's decision and must specify whether the appellant desires the Board to hold a public hearing on its appeal. An appellant who does not request a public hearing in the written notice of appeal is considered to have waived any opportunity for a public hearing. The decision to hold a public hearing is discretionary with the Board. If notice to an appellant was required and was given as required, an untimely appeal must be summarily dismissed by the Chair. If the Chair decides an appellant is not an aggrieved person, the Chair may dismiss the appeal. The Chair's ruling to dismiss an appeal for lack of standing as an aggrieved person is appealable to the full Board.
- (2) **Content of appeal.** The written notice of the appeal must include, but need not be limited to, evidence demonstrating the appellant's standing as an aggrieved person, the findings, conclusions or conditions objected to or believed to be in error, the basis of the objections or challenge, and the remedy sought. If the appellant is requesting that supplemental evidence be included in the record and considered by the Board, such a request, with the proposed supplemental evidence, must be submitted with the appeal. If participants in an appeal agree to use mediation or another form of alternative dispute resolution to resolve the appeal and so notify the Board, the Board will not hear the matter until the conclusion of that effort, provided the effort at resolution does not extend beyond six months of filing of the appeal. The Board may accept, reject or modify any mediated settlement that does not include withdrawal of the appeal.

---

*NOTE: The Board encourages the use of mediation and other forms of Alternative Dispute Resolution as means to reach mutually agreeable resolutions.*

---

A Notice of Appeal must be addressed to:

Chair, Board of Environmental Protection  
17 State House Station  
Augusta, ME 04333-0017

Notices of appeal must be copied to the Commissioner and the licensee. The Board staff shall provide written notice of the appeal to all interested persons.

- (3) **Response to appeal if no supplemental evidence is offered by an appellant.** If no supplemental evidence is offered by an appellant, the complete response to the appeal must be filed within 30 days of filing of the appeal. If the response to the appeal includes proposed supplemental evidence, the appellant may file a rebuttal addressing only the admissibility of that supplemental evidence within 45 days of the filing of the appeal.

- (4) Response to an appeal if supplemental evidence is offered by an appellant. If supplemental evidence is offered by an appellant, a response to the appeal addressing the admissibility of the proposed supplemental evidence and providing any proposed supplemental evidence offered by the respondent must be filed within 30 days of filing of the appeal. If the respondent proposes supplemental evidence, the appellant may file a rebuttal addressing only the admissibility of that supplemental evidence within 45 days of the filing of the appeal.
- (5) Supplemental Evidence. The record for appeals heard by the Board is the administrative record prepared by the Department in its review of the application.

If any person seeks to supplement the record, that person shall provide copies of all new documents and, if a public hearing is requested, summaries of all proposed testimony, including the name and qualifications of each witness, to the Board, Department staff and all other persons notified of the appeal. The names and addresses of persons notified of the appeal may be obtained from the Board staff.

The Board may allow the record to be supplemented on appeal when it finds that the evidence offered is relevant and material and that:

- (a) the person seeking to supplement the record has shown due diligence in bringing the evidence to the attention of the Department at the earliest possible time; or
- (b) the evidence is newly discovered and could not, by the exercise of reasonable diligence, have been discovered in time to be presented earlier in the licensing process.

The Chair shall rule on the admissibility of supplemental evidence no later than 50 days after the filing of the appeal. All additional argument on the appeal must be filed within 20 days of the Chair's decision. Further evidence may not be provided directly to Board members or distributed at Board meetings or hearings without specific permission of the Chair. The Chair may accept into the record additional evidence and analysis submitted by the Department in response to issues raised on appeal or new evidence offered by the participants.

- (6) Procedure. The procedure for hearings on appeals is governed by section 7(C) of this rule. Appeals decided without a hearing will be considered based on written submissions and oral argument at a regular meeting of the Board as follows:

- (a) the executive analyst for the Board briefly introduces the appeal, indicating the subject matter, the appellant's basis for appeal and the relevant statutes and rules;
- (b) the appellant or its representative makes a presentation discussing objections or challenges to the Commissioner's decision on the application and presenting such additional evidence as the Chair has previously determined to be admissible;
- (c) when the appellant is a person other than the licensee, the licensee is then provided an opportunity to address the issues raised by the appellant;
- (d) at the Chair's discretion, other persons may comment on the appeal;
- (e) Department staff makes a presentation addressing the objections and challenges of the appellant and indicating the Commissioner's recommended disposition of the appeal;
- (f) at the Chair's discretion, the appellant and licensee may be provided with a final opportunity for rebuttal.

The Board, its staff and legal representative may at any time address questions to any person participating in the appeal.

- (7) **Decision.** The Board shall, as expeditiously as possible, affirm all or part, affirm with conditions, order a public hearing to be held as expeditiously as possible, or reverse all or part of the decision of the Commissioner. The Board's decision is based on the administrative record prepared by the Department in its review of the application, any additional evidence admitted into the record pursuant to section 24(B)(4) of this rule and any evidence admitted during the course of a hearing on the appeal. The Board is not bound by the Commissioner's findings of fact or conclusions of law. An evenly divided vote of the Board has the effect of affirming the Commissioner's decision unless a majority of Board members subsequently vote at that meeting for another action on the appeal or table the matter until another meeting. In the case of an evenly divided vote, the findings and reasoning of the Board members voting in favor of the Commissioner's decision constitute the Board's reasoning in the affirmation.

25. **Petition for reconsideration of a Board decision.** Within 30 days from the effective date of a Board decision approving or denying a license application, any aggrieved person may petition the Board in writing to request reconsideration of that decision. A person may file only one petition and may not file a petition to reconsider a decision that is an appeal or review of a final license or permit decision made by the Commissioner. The petition must set forth in detail the findings, conclusions or conditions objected to or believed to be in error, the basis for the objections, the nature of any additional evidence to be offered, and the nature of the relief requested, including any request for a public hearing. A petitioner who does not request a public hearing in the

